Child Maltreatment and Out-of-Home Placement: Examining the Influence of Different Child Welfare Service Indicators on Young Adult Outcomes

Dylan L. Robertson
Josh Mersky
Dimitri Topitzes
Arthur Reynolds

University of Wisconsin-Madison
School of Social Work
Wasiman Center

Preparation of this paper was supported by the National Institute of Child Health and Human Development (R01HD034294) and the Doris Duke Charitable Foundation (No. 20030035).

Research Questions

- What are the prevalence rates for 3 child welfare service indicators (substantiated child maltreatment, out-of-home placement, and child welfare family case histories) for children in the CLS?
- What early childhood and family factors are related to child welfare service indicators?
- What are the relations between mutually exclusive child welfare service groups and young adult outcomes (HS completion, HS graduation, adult incarceration, public aid receipt and substance use/misuse)?

Outcome measures (by age 23)

Educational attainment (n = 1368)
- High school completion (67.0%)
- High school graduation (51.4%)

Crime (n = 1427)
- Arrest with conviction (22.4%)
- Incarceration or jail (state, federal or county, 22.6%)

Other measures of well being
- Daily substance use/misuse (n = 1142, 13.4%)
- Any public aid receipt (n = 1315, 60.3%)
- 2 or more years of Medicaid and/or Food Stamps (31.2%)
- 1 or more years of AFDC/TANF, females only (n = 679, 22.2%)
- Teen (<18) parenthood, females only (n = 706, 31.7%)

Data were obtained from administrative records from the Chicago Public Schools, the Cook County Adult Court (CCAC), Illinois Department of Children and Family Services (DCFS), Illinois Board of Higher Education (IBHE) and participant surveys.

Child Welfare Service Measures (by age 18)

Used as outcomes and predictors

- Child protection service cases (n = 325)
  - Child Abuse and Neglect Tracking System (CANTS)
  - Child and Youth Centered Information System (CYCIS)
  - Cook County Juvenile Court (CCJC)
  - Chicago Public School Student Information System (CPSSIS)

- Substantiated abuse or neglect (n = 191)
  - Indicated (substantiated reports) from the Cook County Juvenile Court (CCJC) and the Illinois Department of Children and Family Services (DCFS)

- Out-of-home placement (n = 116)
  - Placement records from CCJC and DCFS
Early childhood and family factors

CPC program measures
- CPC preschool
- CPC school-age

Family risk factors (age 4)
- High school level poverty (> 59%)
- Mother’s a teen parent (< 18)
- Single parent status
- AFDC participation
- Free Lunch eligibility
- Mother completed high school
- Mother employed full/part time
- Four or more children in household

Covariates
- Any child welfare case history (age 4)
- CPC program sites (20)
- Sex of child
- Race/ethnicity of child
- Missing risk factor dummy (age 4)

Data analysis

Descriptive statistics
Examine the effects of early childhood and family factors on rates of substantiated abuse and neglect, out-of-home placement and child protection services
  - Probit regression
  - Coefficients transformed to marginal effects

Examine the effects of early childhood, family factors and each child welfare service measure on measures of young adult well being

Examine the effects of mutually exclusive child welfare service measures (child age 4 to 17) on young adult well being
  - Substantiated maltreatment/ no out of home care (n = 86)
  - Substantiated maltreatment/ out of home care (n = 91)
  - No substantiated maltreatment/ child welfare case history (n = 121)
  - No child welfare case history (comparison group, n = 1113)

Descriptive statistics, Child Welfare Service Measures

### Any Child Protection Service Case History, Substantiated Maltreatment, and Out-of-Home Placement During Different Child Age Periods

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Child welfare measure</th>
<th>N total sample</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>CPC preschool</th>
<th>CPC school-age</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Any CPS case history</td>
<td>1411</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 4-6</td>
<td>1411</td>
<td>10.7</td>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>9.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 4-9</td>
<td>1411</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>20.4</td>
<td>21.4</td>
<td>19.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 10-17</td>
<td>1411</td>
<td>29.0</td>
<td>23.1</td>
<td>26.6</td>
<td>20.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 4-17</td>
<td>1411</td>
<td>22.5</td>
<td>21.3</td>
<td>21.8</td>
<td>17.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 0-17</td>
<td>1411</td>
<td>18.4</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>14.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Any substantiated maltreatment</th>
<th>N total sample</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>CPC preschool</th>
<th>CPC school-age</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age 4-6</td>
<td>1411</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 4-9</td>
<td>1411</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>5.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 10-17</td>
<td>1411</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 4-17</td>
<td>1411</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>13.8</td>
<td>10.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 0-17</td>
<td>1411</td>
<td>13.5</td>
<td>12.6</td>
<td>14.7</td>
<td>11.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Any out-of-home placement</th>
<th>N total sample</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>CPC preschool</th>
<th>CPC school-age</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age 4-6</td>
<td>1411</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 4-9</td>
<td>1411</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 10-17</td>
<td>1411</td>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 4-17</td>
<td>1411</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 0-17</td>
<td>1411</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>7.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Out-of-home placement excludes temporary and protective custody cases.

Robust Effects for CPC Program on the Child Welfare Measures

Adjusted Means and Differences for CPC Preschool, CPC School-age on Three Child Welfare Measures from Child Ages 4 to 17

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Child welfare measure</th>
<th>prek compared group</th>
<th>group</th>
<th>Difference</th>
<th>p-value</th>
<th>postk compared group</th>
<th>group</th>
<th>Difference</th>
<th>p-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Any child welfare case history</td>
<td>16.9</td>
<td>22.5</td>
<td>-5.6</td>
<td>.069</td>
<td>14.7</td>
<td>23.6</td>
<td>-8.9</td>
<td>.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Any out-of-home placement</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>-5.8</td>
<td>.001</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>-0.9</td>
<td>.524</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Any substantiated maltreatment</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>-7.5</td>
<td>.002</td>
<td>13.1</td>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>-1.9</td>
<td>.393</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: N for all models is 1411. All models include CPC preschool, CPC school-age, sex of child, race/ethnicity, CPC program sites, the eight indicators of family risk (child age < 4), a missing risk dummy variable, and any child welfare case histories before age 4.

Less robust findings
- Maternal education and age, single-parent status, AFDC participation, 4 or more children, and high school level poverty
Summary of Major Findings

- CPC program (preschool) participation was robustly related to reductions in child welfare service measures
- Child welfare measures were robust predictors of young adult outcomes across different domains
- The effects of maltreatment varied substantially by child welfare group
- A trend suggesting a compensatory benefit associated with placement

Limitations

- Minimal differences found for placement type and placement stability
- Our measures of maltreatment and out-of-home placement may underestimate actual rates
- Findings are correlational and not causal

Implications

- School-based early interventions can have preventive effects on maltreatment related child welfare services.
- Different pattern of effects based on different maltreatment groups
- Out-of-home placement appeared to buffer some maltreatment effects